## **EXHIBIT B**

June 14, 2016 Deposition Transcript of Rachel Frady, Chief Compliance Officer of Defendant Stellar Recovery, Inc. UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT for the Eastern District of Michigan

Civil Action No. 2:15-CV-11717-SJM-MKM

LAKISHA T. SMITH,

Plaintiff,

v.

STELLAR RECOVERY, INC., et al.,

Defendants.

DEPOSITION OF

RACHEL FRADY

Taken on behalf of the Plaintiff

DATE: Tuesday, June 14, 2016

TIME: 10:16 a.m. to 11:04 a.m.

LOCATION: Jacksonville Area Legal Aid

127 West Adams Street 7th Floor Conference Room Jacksonville, Florida 32202

Examination of the witness taken before:

Heather Manazir, RPR, FPR,
and Notary Public in and for the State of Florida

JACKSONVILLE COURT REPORTING, INC.
POST OFFICE BOX 5675
JACKSONVILLE, FLORIDA 32247
(904) 743-5791

```
APPEARANCES
 1
 2
 3
 4
       On behalf of the Plaintiff:
            STEPHEN A. THOMAS, Esquire
 5
            645 Griswold Street, Suite 1360
            Detroit, Michigan 48226
 6
            (313) 965-BANK (2265)
 7
            sthomas@313965BANK.com
 8
 9
       On behalf of the Defendant:
10
            ALISON EMERY, Esquire
11
            Assurance Law Group
            3731 Hendricks Avenue
12
            Jacksonville, Florida 32207
13
            (904) 497-4904
            alison@assurancelawgroup.com
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

1	INDEX
2	
3	EXAMINATIONS
4	WITNESS
5	RACHEL FRADY
6	DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. THOMAS4
7	
8	EXHIBITS
9	FOR IDENTIFICATION:
10	PLAINTIFF'S EXHIBIT 724
11	PLAINTIFF'S EXHIBIT 811
12	PLAINTIFF'S EXHIBIT 97
13	PLAINTIFF'S EXHIBIT 1037
14	PLAINTIFF'S EXHIBIT 1138
15	PLAINTIFF'S EXHIBIT 1239
16	PLAINTIFF'S EXHIBIT 1339
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

```
1
                      STIPULATION
 2
            It was stipulated and agreed by and between
    counsel for the respective parties, and the witness,
 3
 4
    that the reading and signing of the deposition by the
   witness was waived.
5
6
7
             THE COURT REPORTER: Ma'am, would you raise
       your right hand, please?
8
             Do you swear or affirm that the testimony you
9
10
        are about to give will be the truth?
11
             THE WITNESS:
                           Yes.
12
             THE COURT REPORTER: Thank you.
13
14
                          RACHEL FRADY,
   having been produced and first duly sworn as a witness,
15
16
    testified as follows:
17
                       DIRECT EXAMINATION
   BY MR. THOMAS:
18
19
             I'm attorney Stephen Thomas, and I represent
        0
    the plaintiff in this matter, Lakisha Smith.
2.0
21
             What is your name?
22
        Α
             Rachel Frady.
23
             Okay. And spell your last name.
        0
24
        Α
             F-r-a-d-y.
             Okay. You understand you're under oath, right?
25
        Q
```

Jacksonville Court Reporting, Inc.

```
1
        Α
             Yes, sir.
 2
                    And let me ask you a few preliminary
        Q
    questions.
 3
 4
             Today, you're not under any influence of
   medication, drugs, or alcohol that would prevent you
5
    from testifying truthfully today?
6
7
        Α
             No, sir.
             And when I ask a question, and you're able to
8
9
   give an answer, I'm going to assume that you heard the
10
    question and that you understood the question, if you're
    able to give the answer --
11
12
        Α
             Okay.
             -- is that fair enough?
13
        Q
             Yes, sir.
14
        Α
15
             You live here in Jackson [sic]?
        Q
16
        Α
             Yes.
17
             All your life?
        0
             Since I was five.
18
        Α
             Since you were five?
19
        0
20
             Uh-huh.
        Α
21
             Fair enough to me.
        Q
             How old are you now?
22
23
             31.
        Α
24
             31.
                  In the last ten years, have you been
        Q
    convicted of a felony?
25
```

```
1
        Α
             No.
 2
             What's your highest level of education?
        Q
             High school.
 3
        Α
             And that was here in Jackson --
 4
        Q
5
        Α
             Yes.
             -- Jacksonville?
        0
6
7
             Where do you work now?
        Α
             Stellar Recovery.
8
9
             How long have you worked for Stellar Recovery?
        Q
10
        Α
             Three years as of October of this year, so a
    little over two-and-a-half years.
11
12
        Q
             Okay. What's your title now?
13
             Chief compliance officer.
        Α
             Chief compliant [sic] officer. Had you always
14
        0
    been chief compliance officer?
15
16
        Α
             No, sir.
17
             When you first got to Stellar, what was your
        0
   position?
18
19
        Α
             Director of quality assurance.
20
        Q
             Where did you work before Stellar?
21
             Enhanced Recovery Company.
        Α
22
             How many years had you worked there?
        Q
23
        Α
             Ten years.
24
             Okay. So you had a little experience before
        Q
    you got over to Stellar about collection?
25
```

```
1
        Α
             Yes, sir.
 2
             Now, your position now, what -- say it again.
        0
    What is it?
 3
 4
        Α
             Chief compliance officer.
 5
             Chief compliance officer. What are your duties
        0
   as chief compliance officer?
6
7
        Α
             Multiple things. I ensure our collectors and
    our policies and procedures are compliant with federal
8
   regulations, client regulations. That's my main focus.
9
10
            (Plaintiff's Exhibit 9 was marked for
    identification.)
11
   BY MR. THOMAS:
12
                    I'm showing you what has been previously
13
        0
   marked as -- as Plaintiff's Exhibit Number 9.
14
15
                          I've got one for you. Keep it.
             MR. THOMAS:
16
        That's yours to keep.
17
             MS. EMERY: Okay.
                                Thanks, Stephen.
   BY MR. THOMAS:
18
19
        0
             All right.
             (Reviewing document.)
2.0
        Α
21
             Do you recognize that?
        Q
             I don't recognize it, but I can read what it
22
        Α
23
    is.
24
             Okay.
                    What is it?
        Q
             It looks like the contract between Stellar and
25
        Α
```

Jacksonville Court Reporting, Inc.

```
Comcast.
1
 2
        0
             Okay. On the very first page, paragraph two,
    compliance with applicable laws and security
 3
 4
    standards --
        Α
 5
             Uh-huh.
             -- do you see that?
        0
6
7
        Α
             Uh-huh.
             Is that a yes?
8
        Q
9
        Α
             Yes.
10
        0
             Just for her.
11
        Α
             Yes.
                   Sorry.
             You don't have to apologize. Just --
12
        Q
13
             MS. EMERY: It's hard for her to type a head
14
        nod.
15
             THE WITNESS: Uh-huh.
16
             MR. THOMAS:
                           Yeah.
17
   BY MR. THOMAS:
             Could you read the first sentence?
18
        0
             In providing the services hereunder, vendor
19
        Α
    hereby agrees to comply with all applicable laws,
2.0
    including, without limitation, the federal Fair Debt
21
    Collection Practices Act.
22
23
             All right. And what does that mean to you, as
        Q
24
    compliance -- chief of compliance?
             It means that Stellar will here -- adhere to
25
        Α
```

```
the FDCPA.
1
 2
             Okay. And, in your own words, what is the
        Q
   FDCPA?
 3
             It's what governs collection agencies to ensure
4
        Α
   best business practices.
5
             All right. Could you give me an example of a
        0
6
   violation of the FDCPA?
7
             I mean, I guess it could -- it -- it could
8
   depend on if -- the FDCPA is not very clear all the
9
10
    time.
11
        Q
             Okay.
             A violation could be, you know, harassment, I
12
        Α
13
    guess you could say.
             Harassment. Okay. Anything else?
14
        0
             There's -- FDCPA is very broad, and I think we
15
        Α
16
    could go on for all day, if you want to, talking about
17
   possible violations.
             Well, let's go on --
18
        Q
             And I guess I'm not --
19
        Α
             -- to that.
20
        Q
21
             -- exactly sure what you're asking.
        Α
             I'm asking you, as compliance officer --
22
        Q
23
             Uh-huh.
        Α
             -- chief compliance officer, give me all the
24
    violations that you know.
25
```

```
Uh-huh.
1
        Α
2
             You indicated one is harassment.
        Q
             Uh-huh.
 3
        Α
             Anything else?
 4
        Q
             Continuing -- continuing to call if not asked.
 5
        Α
             Right.
6
        0
7
        Α
             Charging fees in states that don't allow fees.
    There's multiple. Do you want me to list every
8
    single --
9
10
        0
             Please.
             MS. EMERY: To the extent that -- object to the
11
12
        form; to the extent you know, to the extent you can
13
        do that.
14
             MR. THOMAS: Are you trying to coach somebody
15
        over here?
16
             MS. EMERY: No. You're asking her to cite the
17
        whole FDCPA. Can you?
             Yeah. It's -- it's -- the FDCPA is -- is huge.
18
    I'm -- I'll just tell you --
19
   BY MR. THOMAS:
2.0
             There's only -- you've only given three.
21
                                                         Is
    that the only three that you know?
22
             No, it's not the only three that I know.
23
        Α
                                                        But
24
    it's the only three that I could tell you off the top of
   my head.
25
```

```
Fair enough. So those are the only three that
1
        0
 2
   you could tell me off the top of your head --
        Α
             Yes.
 3
        0
             -- correct?
 4
 5
             MS. EMERY: Object to the form.
   BY MR. THOMAS:
6
7
        0
             All right. Let me ask you this.
8
        Α
             Uh-huh.
9
             Would -- would contacting a consumer after a
        0
10
   bankruptcy has -- has discharged debt --
11
        Α
             Yes.
             -- would that be a violation?
12
        Q
13
        Α
             Yes.
14
             Okay. What about calling a consumer in
        0
   attempts to collect a debt, when the debt had been part
15
16
    -- previously discharged in bankruptcy? Would that be a
    violation?
17
        Α
18
             Yes.
            (Plaintiff's Exhibit 8 was marked for
19
    identification.)
2.0
   BY MR. THOMAS:
21
             Okay. I'm handing you what has been previously
22
        Q
   marked as Plaintiff's Exhibit 8.
23
24
        Α
             Do you want these ones back, or just keeping
    them to the side?
25
```

```
1
             MS. EMERY: Keep them there for the court
2
        reporter.
 3
             THE WITNESS: Okay.
 4
             MR. THOMAS: I've got to get you one of them.
             MS. EMERY: Yeah, if you have one.
 5
             MR. THOMAS: I have one.
6
7
             MS. EMERY: You gave me --
             MR. THOMAS: Looking at --
8
9
             MS. EMERY: -- you gave me -- you gave me two.
10
             MR. THOMAS: Yeah.
             MS. EMERY: Well, I think it's the same thing.
11
12
             MR. THOMAS: All right.
13
   BY MR. THOMAS:
             Looking at Exhibit 8, do you recognize what
14
       0
    that is?
15
16
       Α
          Yes.
17
             And what is that?
             It's an account history report from our
18
        Α
    collection software.
19
             Okay. And that -- would that collection
20
        Q
    software be Latitude?
21
             Yes, sir.
22
        Α
23
             When was this report generated?
        Q
24
       Α
             Report date says 12/3/2015.
             And would this be a -- and would this be a
25
        Q
```

```
business record?
1
 2
        Α
             Can you define business record?
             A record that would be kept in the normal
 3
        0
 4
    course of business.
             Yes, sir.
 5
        Α
             All right. And would you agree with me that
6
        0
7
    this business record, Exhibit 8, is a true and fair
    representation of the activ- -- account history for
8
9
   Lakisha Smith?
10
        Α
             Yes, sir.
             All right. Now, let's -- let's take a look at
11
        Q
    Exhibit 8. Let me ask you a few questions on it.
12
13
             When is the first -- strike that.
14
             Let's start at the very top. What is the ID
15
   number?
16
        Α
             The account ID?
17
             Our account ID.
        0
             That is Stellar Recovery's file number for this
18
        Α
    account. It's our unique file number.
19
             Okay. And that would be 12884152, correct?
20
        Q
             Yes, sir.
21
        Α
             And what's the status, RCL? What does that
22
        Q
23
   mean?
24
        Α
             Recall.
                      That means the account has been closed
    and returned to the client.
25
```

```
Okay. And account number, what would -- no,
1
        0
   no. Customer. Let's do that line. What's that?
2
             Comcast. That is the -- the account that this
 3
        Α
 4
    is.
             And abbreviation would be the COMCA?
5
        0
        Α
             Yes.
6
7
             And that account number, what is that? Is that
        0
    the Comcast number?
8
9
        Α
             That's Comcast's specific account number --
10
        0
             Okay.
             -- that was assigned.
11
        Α
             And that would be 01 -- strike that --
12
        0
    0610539067506, correct?
13
14
        Α
             Yes.
             And it -- it says, Next received. And the
15
        0
16
    date, what date is that?
17
        Α
             That's the date that Stellar Recovery received
    the account from Comcast in our office.
18
             Okay. And what date is that?
19
        0
             6/21/2014.
2.0
        Α
             All right. And it indicates that it was
21
        0
22
    closed?
23
        Α
             Yes.
24
             Does that mean that it was closed out as far as
        Q
    Stellar, or does it mean Comcast closed it out?
25
```

```
1
        Α
             That means --
             Tell me what that means.
2
        0
             -- Stellar Recovery closed the account.
 3
        Α
             Okay. And what date would that be?
 4
        Q
5
             7/29/2015.
        Α
             And returned, what date is that?
6
        0
7
        Α
             7/29/2015.
             Does that mean that it was returned back to
8
        Q
9
    Comcast?
10
        Α
             Yes, sir.
             Why was it closed out on 7/29/15?
11
        Q
             One second.
12
        Α
13
             Yeah.
                    Take your time.
        0
             It looks like it was a final recall, meaning
14
        Α
    that the account was placed in our office for the
15
16
    duration of time assigned, and it was closed because of
17
    that.
18
        0
             What are you looking at to indicate that it was
    for a duration of time?
19
2.0
        Α
             It's -- it says on 7/29/2015, Received a final
21
    recall, closing and returning.
22
             What -- what page are you on?
        Q
             That's page four of five. It's on the 7/29
23
        Α
    note, second to the bottom.
24
25
        Q
             Okay.
                    What about the line for 7/14/2015, the
```

```
-- the line that has RL under the two -- well, I believe
1
    that's your action, and result is CO. What -- what does
 2
    that mean?
 3
             MS. EMERY: I think you mean 7 -- 5/14.
 4
        There's no 7/14 entry.
 5
   BY MR. THOMAS:
6
7
        0
             5/14.
             What does what mean? There's a --
        Α
8
9
             The line. The line that has the RL --
        0
10
        Α
             CO?
             -- and the CO, correct.
11
        Q
             That means we received a letter, and this is a
12
        Α
13
    comment only. And if -- if you read the note, we
    received a lawsuit for calling consumer after BK.
14
             All right.
15
        Q
16
             So that's just our notation to the account that
17
    that was received.
             So would that be the reason why the account was
18
        0
    closed out?
19
20
        Α
             No.
21
             Okay. Was there any phone calls to the -- to
        Q
    Lakisha Smith or letter sent after that notation?
22
        Α
23
             No.
24
             Okay. Going back to page one of five, there's
        Q
   many entries for 6/21/2014, correct?
25
```

```
1
        Α
             Yes, sir.
2
             All right. And the first line, it indicates,
        0
   Account -- account received from client.
 3
        Α
             Yes.
 4
             That started it all, correct?
 5
        Q
             Yes, sir.
        Α
6
7
             Next line, Phone information has been updated
        0
    from client.
8
9
             What does that mean?
10
        Α
             It means that when the account was received,
    that there was a phone number that came with the
11
12
    account, and it was updated to the account.
             All right. Then going down, skipping the blank
13
    line, the same information, correct?
14
             Yes.
15
        Α
16
             Then, Miscellaneous extra data added, what --
17
    what does that reflect?
             It's another data field for the account. It's
18
        Α
    just miscell- -- miscellaneous information, and it shows
19
    where a service address was added to the account of the
2.0
    13097 Longview Street.
21
             Would that be where the Comcast account would
22
    -- would have been?
23
2.4
        Α
             Yes, service address.
25
        Q
             All right. And the next line, it says,
```

```
Disconnect reason, and -- and has an N. What does that
1
 2
   mean?
             I'm not sure what the N means.
 3
        Α
             Do you know who might know what the N means?
 4
        Q
 5
             Possibly, Comcast.
        Α
             And the next line, Deposit amount zero?
6
        0
7
        Α
             Yes.
             What does that mean?
8
        Q
9
             I don't know.
        Α
10
        0
             All right. And the customer type, Residential?
11
        Α
             Yes.
12
             As opposed to a business, correct?
        Q
13
             Correct.
        Α
             And the next line, Dwelling type one.
14
        0
15
             What's a Dwelling type one?
16
        Α
             I don't know.
17
             And the next line, Tax ID type, Social Security
        0
18
   number.
19
             Would SSA -- SSN mean Social Security number?
             Yes, sir.
20
        Α
21
             All right. What is the region entity Detroit?
    That means that's where it's located?
22
23
        Α
             Yes.
24
             Now, it said, File sent to IDA for litigious
    debtor scrub.
25
```

What does that mean? 1 2 Α It's a scrub that we do to see if this consumer's previously had any litigation. It's just 3 4 that's what that states. And the next line, Account sent to TLO for 5 bankruptcy-deceased scrub. 6 7 What -- what does TLO mean? Transunion. It's a vendor that we use to do Α 8 our bankruptcy-deceased scrubs. 9 10 0 Backing up to IDA, what -- what company is that? 11 They've changed their names several times. 12 don't know what the acronym stands for. It's now IDI. 13 I don't know. 14 Would that be the same company that you --15 0 16 that's your vendor now, as it was back in June? 17 We do still use them. Α Okay. And Exchange, what does that mean? 18 0 19 Α Exchange, that's the system, the interface that we use when downloading information. It's just where 2.0 it's going through to load to the account. 21 Explain the next line where there's, Fusion, 22 the send and send and the actual result line. Read the 23 2.4 comment. Explain that to me. ID info two service data ordered on 6/22/2014. 25 Α

```
It's just for the -- the TLO that you see
1
            It's just showing that we ordered bankruptcy
2
    scrub and deceased scrub.
 3
             Now, do you know, are you aware that Ms. --
 4
   Ms. Smith filed bankruptcy back in -- in May of 2014, I
5
   believe it is?
7
        Α
             I'm aware because of this case.
             Okay. So she filed bankruptcy prior to you --
8
   you getting the -- the account, correct?
9
10
        Α
             Yes.
             All right. And -- and your reason for
11
        0
12
    contacting her -- you do agree you did contact her after
13
    a bankruptcy, correct?
             Yes, sir.
14
        Α
             And why is that?
15
        0
16
             We did a bankruptcy scrub, and because of the
    Social Security number on file, ending in 5694, it did
17
   not identify a bankruptcy.
18
19
             Where did you get the Social Security number,
        0
    5694?
20
             It was received from Comcast in the file when
21
   we got the account on 6/21/2014.
22
             Okay. So you don't know whether or not
23
        0
24
   Ms. Smith provided the 5694 Social Security number,
25
    correct?
```

```
1
        Α
             I would assume that she provided that phone
 2
    [sic] number.
             Why -- why would you assume that?
 3
             I don't know where else Comcast would have got
        Α
 4
    that Social Security number.
5
             What -- what proofs or evidence would you show
6
        0
7
    a jury that Ms. Smith provided Social Security 5694 to
8
   Comcast?
9
             I don't have any proof, other than every other
10
    single account that we receive from Comcast comes with a
    Social Security number in the file that's received from
11
    the customer. I would like to think that Comcast isn't
12
13
    making up Social Security numbers for consumers.
             So it's fair to say you have no proof?
14
        0
15
        Α
             Correct.
16
             All right. Now, going to the next line, we
    already talked about the -- the scrub for previous
17
    litigation, correct? We did that?
18
             Yes, sir.
19
        Α
             Okay. Let's talk about that scrub for that
20
        Q
   phone number, (313) 523-2310. Do you see that line?
21
22
        Α
             Yes.
             Okay. What's that all about?
23
        0
24
             File sent to IDA for cell phone scrub for cell
        Α
25
   phone number.
```

```
It means that we're sending the phone number to
1
    our -- our scrub vendor to determine the phone type for
2
    this phone number.
 3
             Why is that important?
 4
             We like to know the type of phone number to
 5
   make sure that we're complying with calling.
6
7
        Q
             Explain that.
             If it's a cell phone, we'd call HCI, human
8
    intervention, and if it's -- it wasn't, we would have a
9
10
    different dialing method.
             What would that dialing method be?
11
        0
             It would be our RPC dialer.
12
        Α
13
             So HCI is for -- stands for Human Call
    Initiator?
14
15
        Α
             Yes, sir.
16
             Okay. And the RPC, so we know what we're
17
    talking about, is the Right Party Connect?
             Yes, sir.
18
        Α
19
                   (Cell phone interruption.)
20
             MR. THOMAS: Excuse me. Excuse me. Thank you.
   BY MR. THOMAS:
21
             And, now, the next line in the case, Scrub for
22
        Q
   phone number (949) 154-1313, correct?
23
2.4
        Α
             Yes.
             Would that be the same thing, looking to see
25
        Q
```

```
whether or not it's a cell phone or a landline?
1
        Α
             Yes, sir.
 2
             What were the results of those two scrubs, the
 3
        0
    first one for the 313 area code, (313) 523-2310?
4
             One second.
                          It's appears that it resulted in a
5
   match, and the phone number was updated to a cell due to
6
7
   match.
             And the next one, the (949) 154-1313?
8
9
             Sorry. I'm trying to find that notation.
   don't see where that was returned. I don't know if it's
10
    due to the -- it doesn't appear to be a valid telephone
11
   number.
12
13
             So in your records, you -- you have a incorrect
   number, phone number, it would appear?
14
15
        Α
             It appears.
16
             Okay. Just like it appears that the Social
17
    Security number is incorrect, correct?
18
        Α
             Yes.
19
             All right. Now, the line 23/14, the 6:37,
        0
    Fusion, send, send, Innovis, RPC, tell me about that
20
21
    one. Read it, and then tell me -- explain it to me.
             Fusion, send, Innovis RPC service data ordered,
22
       Α
    I'm not exactly sure what that means.
23
24
        Q
             Okay.
                    The next line is a home number,
    (313) 918-7482, and that was added as a home number?
25
```

```
Yes, sir.
 1
        Α
 2
             So what system would you use to contact that?
    Would that be the RPC?
 3
 4
        Α
             Yes, sir.
             The next line, (313) 718-5938 added, and it
 5
        0
    says home, correct?
 6
 7
        Α
             Yes, sir.
        Q
             And so that would be RPC as well, correct?
 8
 9
        Α
           Correct.
10
        0
             And that -- that phone number is Lakisha Smith
    cell phone, correct?
11
12
             MS. EMERY: Object to the form.
13
             I don't know.
        Α
           You don't know?
14
        0
15
            (Shakes head.)
        Α
16
            (Plaintiff's Exhibit 7 was marked for
    identification.)
17
    BY MR. THOMAS:
18
             I'm showing you what has been previously marked
19
        0
    as Exhibit -- Plaintiff's Exhibit 7, and let the record
2.0
    reflect that that is Mrs. Smith's metroPCS call log.
21
22
             And do you see the incoming call on the first
    line on 7/18/2014, destination number (313) 718-5938?
23
   A Yes.
24
25
     Q Do you see that?
```

```
A Yes, sir.
2
      Q Would you agree with me that that's a cell
   phone number?
3
   MS. EMERY: Object to the form.
4
   A I guess. I don't -- this isn't --
5
   BY MR. THOMAS:
6
   Q All right.
7
   A -- this isn't my record, so I don't know for
8
9
   this to be --
10
   Q Okay. I don't want you to guess. If you -- if
  you don't know, that's fine.
11
   MS. EMERY: Steve, we're not -- I don't think
12
13
   we're disputing that that's her cell phone, if that
   helps.
14
   MR. THOMAS: All right.
15
16
   MS. EMERY: That way you don't have to ask her
17
   if she agrees that's her cell phone number. We'll
   stipulate that that's her cell phone number.
18
   MR. THOMAS: Fair enough. Moving on.
19
   MS. EMERY: Yes.
20
   BY MR. THOMAS:
21
22
   Q Okay. Based on that stipulation, that that is
   Lakisha Smith's cell phone number, but it's listed in
23
24
   your notes as a home line, correct?
   A Yes.
25
```

```
Why is that?
 1
        0
 2
             I can't tell you why that is.
        Α
             Going to page two of five, are you familiar
 3
        Q
 4
    with that? Do you see it?
 5
        Α
             What page? Yes.
             Two of five.
        0
 6
 7
        Α
             Yes.
             LiveVox began the campaign on June 25th, 2014,
 8
        Q
 9
    correct?
10
        Α
             What date?
             June 25th, 2014.
11
        Q
12
        Α
             Correct. Yes.
             All right. How did Stellar get the number that
13
    we just stipulated, (313) 718-5938? How did they get
14
    that number?
15
16
    A From a scrub.
17
        0
                    What -- what scrub? And explain, show
             Okay.
18
    me.
19
        Α
             A skip tracing that's --
             Where are you -- where are you referring to in
20
        Q
21
    the notes that will show us a skip trace?
             I just see where the number was added, so --
22
        Α
23
             What -- where would that be?
        Q
24
        Α
             Page one of five.
25
        Q
             Yes.
```

```
1
        Α
             On the 6/23 note at 8:02 p.m.
 2
             Added, and you got it from a -- from a skip
        Q
    trace?
 3
 4
        Α
             Yes, sir.
 5
             Okay. So Ms. Smith did not provide that
        Q
    number?
 6
 7
        Α
             You are correct.
             And let's -- let's go back to page two of five
 8
        Q
 9
    when the campaign started.
10
    Where was the first time, based on the
    campaign, that you contacted Ms. Smith using LiveVox?
11
   A Like an actual contact or just an attempt?
12
             Attempt on the -- that cell phone number.
13
           One second.
14
     A
   Q Take your time.
15
16
      A It appears 7/18.
17
             2014?
     0
             Yes, sir.
18
        A
19
             And the time, what time?
        0
20
        Α
             12:48 p.m.
21
             So that's the first contact, based on your
        Q
22
    records, right?
23
             Yes, sir.
        Α
24
             And there was no answer, correct?
        Q
25
        Α
             Correct.
```

```
What campaign was used for that phone call?
 1
        0
 2
             It says, RPC AM- -- AMDOCS, under score,
        Α
    seconds.
 3
             What -- what does that mean?
 4
        Q
             It's the name of the campaign.
 5
             Okay. So you agree with me that that was a
 6
        0
 7
    call to a cell phone, correct?
 8
        Α
             Yes.
    Q Based upon that -- that campaign, RPC, we
9
10
    stipulated that that was automatic telephone dialing
    system, correct?
11
12
   A Yes.
            And you did not have the plaintiff's consent to
13
    call her on that number, correct?
14
             Correct. I will say, however, though, that the
15
        Α
16
    actual phone records could be different than what this
17
          I'm just throwing that out there.
             MR. THOMAS: I'll move to strike as
18
19
        nonresponsive.
    BY MR. THOMAS:
2.0
21
   Q Now, the campaign moved from a RPC to a HCI,
22
    correct?
   A Are we talking about the 5938 phone number?
23
24
     Q Yes. Only -- only going to talk about the 5938
   number for purposes of this deposition. Okay?
25
```

```
A Yes, sir.
2
             All right. How about August 13th?
     A Yes.
3
4
        Q
             All right. So why did the campaign change from
5
   a Right Party Connect to a Human Contact Initiator
    campaign?
6
7
       Α
             I -- I don't know.
             Okay. Now, the Human Contact Initiator, that
8
9
    campaign, it would involve, on your end, uploading
10
   numbers in a file to -- to LiveVox, correct?
             MS. EMERY: Object to the form.
11
             I'm not the dialer.
12
       Α
13
   BY MR. THOMAS:
14
       0
             Okay.
15
             I -- I don't know how the dialer runs.
       Α
16
             All right. Do you know how the -- is it -- is
        Q
17
    it not true that the Human Contact Initiator would --
    would click a button on the screen?
18
             That's correct.
19
       Α
             Okay. And on that screen there's no names,
20
        0
21
    correct?
22
             It's a telephone number.
       Α
23
             A telephone number?
        0
24
        Α
             Yes.
25
        Q
             But no names?
```

```
1
        Α
             Correct.
2
             Okay. And there's no notes, correct?
        0
             Correct.
 3
        Α
             And there's no account information, correct?
 4
        Q
5
        Α
             Correct.
             Such as, We've already called this person five
6
        0
7
    times today; there's no information like that?
             No. But there's logic on our dialer that
        Α
8
9
   wouldn't allow an account to load up if dialed five
10
    times.
             Okay. But there's nothing on the -- on the --
11
        Q
    on the clicker -- clicker -- what do you -- what do you
12
13
    call the person who does the actually clicking?
             We -- we refer to them as clickers.
14
        Α
15
          Clickers?
        0
16
        Α
             Uh-huh.
17
             Okay. So for the purpose of the deposition,
   we're going to refer to them as clickers.
18
             That's fine.
19
        Α
             How many clickers work at Stellar Recovery?
20
        Q
             MS. EMERY: Object to the form.
21
             I don't know.
22
        Α
   BY MR. THOMAS:
23
             Have you ever observed a clicker working?
2.4
        Q
25
        Α
             Uh-huh.
                      Yes.
```

```
Okay. What do they do?
1
        0
 2
             They click phone records.
        Α
             That -- that number we're talking about?
 3
        Q
 4
             Correct.
        Α
             On the screen?
 5
        Q
        Α
             Yes.
6
7
             Do they do anything else?
        Q
             They also -- they collect accounts and --
8
        Α
9
             But as they're -- they're doing their clicking
        Q
10
   duty?
11
        Α
             No. It's -- it's separate.
12
             Okay. So --
        Q
             They have times, designated times.
13
        Α
             Okay. So there's a designated time that --
14
        Q
    that the clicker is only clicking numbers?
15
16
        Α
             Correct.
17
             Okay. Not taking calls?
        0
18
        Α
             Correct.
             MS. EMERY: I'm going to object to the form.
19
20
             Can you just specify the time period for her,
21
        please?
    BY MR. THOMAS:
22
23
             What time period were you referring to in your
        Q
24
    answer?
             As recent as this month.
25
        Α
```

```
1
        0
             Okay.
2
             MR. THOMAS: Is that fine?
             MS. EMERY: I think so. But the system --
 3
 4
        let's go off the record for a minute.
                          Okay. Definitely.
5
             MR. THOMAS:
                  (Discussion off the record.)
6
7
             MR. THOMAS: Back on the record.
   BY MR. THOMAS:
8
9
             Back in 2014, it was a clicker clicking the
        0
10
   number?
11
        Α
             Yes, sir.
12
             All right. Going back to Exhibit Number 9, is
        0
13
    that the contract?
14
        Α
             Yes.
             Okay. The second page, I know they're not
15
        0
16
   numbered, but it would be under Performance
17
   Requirements, 5, and then 5.3, the first line reads, To
    the extent that vendor is authorized by client to gain
18
    remote access to perform the obligations as under the
19
2.0
    contract.
             So you had -- you had access to Comcast's
21
    system for Lakisha to collect on, correct?
22
23
        Α
             No.
24
             Okay. Going back to Exhibit Number 8, I want
        Q
    to go to page three of five. And -- oh, no, let's --
25
```

```
let's back up.
1
 2
             On two of five, who is -- who is CRUPD?
        Α
             What date is that?
 3
 4
             That'll be at the bottom portion under the
    column for action.
                        It's CRUPD.
5
6
        Α
             That's just a user. It's -- it's not an actual
7
             It's when we upload a file to the credit
8
   bureau.
9
             Who's that -- who's that person?
        0
10
        Α
             It isn't a person. That's just --
11
        Q
             That's not a person's name?
12
        Α
             No.
13
             Okay. Okay.
        Q
             Let's -- let's go ahead and go to page three of
14
           And I want to call your attention to the -- the
15
    five.
16
    August 25th, 2014, at 2:40 p.m.
17
             Do you see that line?
18
        Α
             Yes.
             Who is Jen Grove?
19
        0
             She would have been a collector.
2.0
        Α
21
             Do you know her?
        Q
22
        Α
             No.
23
             Is it fair to say she doesn't work there now?
        Q
24
        Α
             I don't know.
             She could have worked there; you just don't
25
        Q
```

```
know?
1
 2
        Α
             I don't know if she still currently works
            I know if her notes are in the account, yes, she
 3
    there.
    absolutely worked there at that day at that time.
4
5
        Q
             Okay.
             I don't know if she still works for us.
        Α
6
7
        0
             Fair enough. While we're on the same subject,
    there's a B. Smith that appears on four of five.
8
             Who is B. Smith?
9
             She's Belinda Smith.
10
        Α
             Okay. Does Belinda Smith still work with
11
        Q
    Stellar?
12
13
        Α
             No.
             Is there a -- is there a high turnover rate for
14
        0
    the collectors?
15
16
        Α
             Yes.
17
             And when you say high turnover rate, what do
   you mean by that?
18
19
        Α
             It's -- it's probably -- I would want to say --
20
    I couldn't give you the actual percentage.
21
        0
             Please.
             I -- I don't know the actual percentage.
22
        Α
23
        Q
             Oh, you don't. Okay.
24
        Α
             But it's a -- it's a high turnover rate.
25
        Q
             A high turnover rate?
```

```
1
        Α
             Yes.
2
             Why do you think so?
        Q
             It's just the industry.
 3
        Α
             Stressful?
 4
        Q
5
             I wouldn't say it's because it's stressful.
        Α
6
        0
             Low pay?
7
        Α
             I wouldn't say because it's low pay.
             What do you say?
8
        Q
9
             MS. EMERY: Object to the form.
10
        Α
             It's not a career for them. It's a call
    center. It's not just collections. It's -- most call
11
12
    centers, if you look at -- research call center turnover
13
    rates, it's not just collections.
   BY MR. THOMAS:
14
15
        0
             Fair enough. Going back to page three of five.
   Are you on that page, ma'am?
16
17
             No. I am now.
        Α
             Okay. And that August 25th, 2014, that Jen
18
        0
19
   Grove --
20
        Α
             Yes.
21
             -- it says in the comments section, Mail return
    set on debtor.
22
23
             What is -- what's that? What's that all about?
24
             As -- it appears as though she marked the
        Α
25
    address as bad.
```

```
She marked the -- what do you mean by that,
1
       0
2
   please?
       Α
             She made the address to be a bad address on our
 3
    system of record.
 4
             I -- I'm not following. Just it's --
 5
             So she made -- there's a -- I guess, to be very
6
7
   detailed, there's a button on Latitude that says, Good
8
   address.
9
             And if you click it, it'll change to bad
10
    address, if as that is not a good address for Lakisha
    Smith.
11
12
             So is that what happened here?
       Q
13
             Yes.
       Α
             She just hit the wrong button?
14
       0
             MS. EMERY: Object to the form.
15
16
       Α
             I don't know if she hit the wrong button. I'm
17
    telling you that's the button that she hit. I don't
   know if it was the wrong button.
18
   BY MR. THOMAS:
19
             Okay. Did Stellar, in fact, send a letter to
20
        Q
   Ms. Smith?
21
22
       Α
             Yes.
23
             MR. THOMAS: Okay. Can we go off the record,
24
       please?
                  (Discussion off the record.)
25
```

```
1
            MR. THOMAS: Okay. Back on the record.
 2
   BY MR. THOMAS:
            Okay. The campaign closed -- based on
 3
       0
 4
    Exhibit 8, it was closed on July 29th, 2015, correct?
            The account?
 5
       Α
            The account.
       0
 6
 7
       A
            Yes, sir.
            So there -- there should have been no contact
 8
 9
    after that point with Lakisha Smith on this account,
10
    correct?
11
       A On this account, yes.
            (Plaintiff's Exhibit 10 was marked for
12
    identification.)
13
   BY MR. THOMAS:
14
   Q Okay. I'm showing you what's been previously
15
   marked as Plaintiff's Exhibit 10. And I'll represent to
16
17
   you that's a screen shot from Lakisha Smith, showing
    that Stellar contacted her on June the 6th, 2016, this
18
   year, a little over a week ago, eight days ago.
19
   Do you know why Stellar would call my client on
20
   her cell phone eight days ago?
21
22
   A Yes.
   Q Why would they call her on her cell phone eight
23
24
   days ago?
   A There was an account placed in our office with
25
```

```
1
   someone else's name that was associated to this
2
   telephone number, so we weren't calling for Lakisha
   Smith.
3
   Q Let -- let -- let -- okay.
4
   Who -- who -- when you attempted to make this
5
   call on June -- or May the -- made the call on June the
6
   6th of this year, who were you attempting to contact?
7
   A I don't know the name off the top of my head.
8
   Q Do you have any account notes that would
9
10
   reflect this?
  A Yes.
11
12
   MR. THOMAS: I'm going to go off the record
   once again.
13
14
    (Discussion off the record.)
15
   MR. THOMAS: Okay. Back on the record.
16
   MS. EMERY: I can, you know -- I can -- the
17
   best I can do is give you, you know, the information
   that we received associated with this phone number.
18
19
   (Plaintiff's Exhibit 11 was marked for
20
   identification.)
   BY MR. THOMAS:
21
22
   Q Showing you Exhibit 11. Based on your prior
   testimony, would you agree that Stellar contacted my
23
24
   client on June -- June the 2nd on her cell phone?
   A Yes. Based off this screen shot, yes.
25
```

```
MR. THOMAS: Okay. What was that now --
    (Plaintiff's Exhibit 12 was marked for
2
   identification.)
3
   BY MR. THOMAS:
4
   Q I'm showing you what has been previously marked
5
   as Plaintiff's Exhibit 12. Would you agree with me that
6
   Stellar contacted my client on her cell phone on
7
  May 27th of this year?
8
   A Yes.
9
   (Plaintiff's Exhibit 13 was marked for
10
11
   identification.)
   BY MR. THOMAS:
12
   Q And showing you Exhibit 13. Would you agree
13
   that Stellar contacted my client on her cell phone on
14
   May 26th of this year at 4:05 p.m.?
15
   A Yes.
16
   O Okay. You can hand all those back to me, the
17
   screen shots.
18
19
   What system was used, what campaign was used to
   contact my client in the recent weeks?
20
   A I don't know. I don't have that information in
21
22
   front of me.
   Q Can you get that for me?
23
24
   A Yes.
   Q Okay. So would it be fair to say it would be
25
```

```
1
    either Right Party Connect or it would be a Human Call
   Initiator?
2
   A Yes, sir.
3
4
   Q Are those the only two campaigns that Stellar
5
   uses?
   A
6
            No.
     Q What other campaigns?
7
     A Quick Connect, which is like RPC.
8
 9
            MS. EMERY: Can we go off the record for a
10
       second?
            MR. THOMAS: Yeah.
11
                 (Discussion off the record.)
12
13
            MR. THOMAS: There was an entry that -- back on
14
       the record again.
15
   BY MR. THOMAS:
16
       Q
            There was an entry that Stellar made a report
    to Lakisha Smith's credit report.
17
18
       Α
            Yes.
19
            When -- when was that?
       0
       A 7/28/2014.
2.0
            And that would have been after she had filed
21
22
   bankruptcy, correct?
23
       Α
            Yes.
24
            And what -- what notation -- well, what
    information was submitted to the credit bureaus?
25
```

```
1
        Α
             What do you -- I'm sorry. What do you mean?
2
             Okay. Reading, it says, Open collection
        0
    account submitted in credit bureau report file.
 3
 4
             What information would have been submitted to
    or in credit bureau report file?
5
             It would have been the balance, the customer
6
        Α
7
   name, our reference number.
             And that -- that -- that she was -- she owed
8
9
    500 and --
10
        Α
             $19.71, yes.
             That would have been submitted to the bureaus?
11
        Q
             Yes, sir.
12
        Α
             On that date and time?
13
        0
             Yes, sir.
14
        Α
15
             All three?
        Q
16
        Α
             Yes, sir.
17
             The three majors?
        0
             Yes, sir.
18
        Α
             And -- and -- and what are the three majors?
19
        0
2.0
        Α
             Transunion, Equifax, and Experian.
21
             MR. THOMAS: I have no further questions.
        Thank you.
22
23
             MS. EMERY:
                         I don't have any.
2.4
             THE COURT REPORTER: Read or waive?
25
             MS. EMERY: Can I keep these? Because I don't
```

```
1
        have any.
             MR. THOMAS: I'll make sure the court reporter
2
 3
        gets them.
             Thank you for your time.
 4
5
             THE WITNESS: You're welcome. Thank you.
             THE COURT REPORTER: Read or waive?
6
7
             THE WITNESS: I'm sorry?
             THE COURT REPORTER: Read or waive?
8
9
             MS. EMERY: We'll waive.
10
                        (Witness excused.)
11
            (Deposition was concluded at 11:04 a.m.)
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

```
1
                           CERTIFICATE
 2
    STATE OF FLORIDA)
 3
4
    COUNTY OF DUVAL )
5
            I, Heather Manazir, a Notary Public in and for
6
7
    the State of Florida at Large, do hereby certify that,
   pursuant to Subpoena to Testify at a Deposition in a
8
9
    Civil Action in the above-entitled cause, I sat at
10
    Jacksonville Area Legal Aid, Inc., 126 West Adams
    Street, Jacksonville, Duval County, Florida, Florida, at
11
    the time stated hereinabove, and was attended by STEPHEN
12
   A. THOMAS, Esquire, 645 Griswold Street, Suite 1360,
13
   Detroit, Michigan, attorney for the Plaintiff; ALISON
14
    EMERY, Esquire, of the law firm of Assurance Law Group,
15
16
    3731 Hendricks Avenue, Jacksonville, Florida, attorney
17
    for the Defendant; and the witness, RACHEL FRADY, who
    was first duly sworn to testify the truth and was
18
    carefully examined, thereupon testified as is
19
    hereinabove shown, and that the testimony of the said
2.0
    witness and proceedings herein were reduced to
21
    typewriting under my personal supervision and are a true
22
    and correct copy of my stenographic notes and electronic
23
2.4
    recording.
            I further certify that pursuant to stipulation
25
```

by and among counsel for the respective parties, and by the witness, that the reading and signing of the 2. deposition were waived. 3 I further certify that I am neither of counsel 4 nor attorney to either of the parties in said cause nor 5 interested in the event of the said cause. 6 7 I further certify that I have delivered the original of said deposition to STEPHEN A. THOMAS, 8 9 Esquire, 645 Griswold Street, Suite 1360, Detroit, 10 Michigan, attorney for the Plaintiff, for his safekeeping. 11 12 13 WITNESS my hand and official seal this 27th day of June, 2016. 14 15 16 seather managi 17 18 Heather Manazir, RPR, FPR Notary Public - State of Florida 19 My Commission expires: 8/14/2018 My Commission No.: FF 129393 20 2.1 Personally Known 2.2 Professionally Known 23 Produced Identification of Work Picture ID Card Χ 2.4 (Driver's License not provided per Counsel for Defendant) 25